#### **Comment Cards**

**CPS Energy Public Input Session** 

Date: February 18, 2019

Case: CPS Energy



NAME: Anonymous
ADDRESS:
CITY/STATE/ZIP:
E-MAIL ADDRESS:
CPS ENERGY® CUSTOMER? (YES) NO (CIRCLE ONE) CITY COUNCIL DISTRICT (IF KNOWN)
COMMENTS:
Please continue to ensure my energy bills wire
affordable AND to the extent possible, you out /keep
Please continue to ensure my energy balls wire affordable AND to the extent possible, you put /keep our community's quality of life as a top priority!
Think you. (Over)



NAME: Jack Elder
ADDRESS:
CITY/STATE/ZIP:
E-MAIL ADDRES
CPS ENERGY® CUSTOMER? (E) NO (CIRCLE ONE) CITY COUNCIL DISTRICT (IF KNOWN) 3
COMMENTS: The crisis presented by climate change is real, presented It will
take concrete actions and compagnes vision to have a systematic work for our
othering. (PS can lead the many by plosting fostil fuel plants (coul material gail
and ramping up conservation, solar and word. Now is the time for action.
√∏ε
(Over)



NAME: Urold Sharez
ADDRESS:
CITY/STATE
E-MAIL ADD
CPS ENERGY® CUSTOMER? YES NO (CIRCLE ONE) CITY COUNCIL DISTRICT (IF KNOWN)
COMMENTS: Thank's lot of information is to
led one too implement some soit
modigation policy Than there we
those that would not believe in these
facts esken when they know it to be
trace, (Over)



NAME: Mitch Hagney
ADDRESS: _
CITY/STATE/
E-MAIL ADDI
CPS ENERGY® CUSTOMER? (ES) NO (CIRCLE ONE) CITY COUNCIL DISTRICT (IF KNOWN)
COMMENTS: I Support the CAAP 93 written. I'm president
Of the Food Policy Course I of San Antonia, and the
plans statements on the food system and land use
are admirable. I am happy to pay a small rate
the to shot down coal faster but not a huge one
(Over)



NAME: Ellen Berky, AX	
ADDRESS:	
CITY/STATE	
E-MAIL ADD	
CPS ENERGY® CUSTOMER? (YES) NO (CIRCLE ONE)	CITY COUNCIL DISTRICT (IF KNOWN)
COMMENTS: To the Whataburger CEO:	Please make the plastic
Straws that you handout optu	onal. I love what a catch (to ea
and would love to reduce	onal. I love what a catch (to eat
which are so harmful to cr	eatures in the oceans.
See www.plastic pollution St	rawsfilm.com
thank you for your work an	d support of the Clemate (over)
Action Plans.	

Regarding CPS administration and its board of Trustees It is putting that CFS does not offer opportunity for commun-ty input at its board of trusteds meetings. The otherpulace utility, SAWS, does this at every meeting even though they don't have to. City council offers this opportunder twice after B sessions in the evening and during the are to become granular, the CPS must foster buy in from its customers and significant Community Stakeholders, not just the Chambers of Commerce. Yes the technologies are Changing, and CPS needs to make its tremendous buying power to empower its customers at every level tomplement chergy Conservation, water and many oran collection, and Substitution, on and off the grad

From: "Everley, Steve"

Date: February 18, 2019 at 3:36:27 PM CST

To: "trustees@cpsenergy.com" < trustees@cpsenergy.com>

Dear Trustees,

My name is Steve Everley, and I serve as spokesman for Texans for Natural Gas. We have hundreds of thousands of advocates all across Texas who support oil and natural gas, including 9,500 who live in CPS Energy's coverage area. The attached letter is being sent on behalf of our advocates in Bexar County, calling attention to concerns we have with the City of San Antonio's recently released draft "Climate Ready" plan, which would phase out affordable energy sources like natural gas.

No fuel has done more in the United States to reduce greenhouse gas emissions than natural gas. In fact, thanks to affordable and abundant supplies of natural gas, the United States leads the world in reducing emissions of carbon dioxide. In the United States, the amount of CO2 that natural gas has prevented from entering the atmosphere since 2006 is equivalent to taking 500 million passenger vehicles off the road for an entire year. As the cleanest-burning fossil fuel, Texas-produced natural gas has also played a key role in reducing local air pollution in San Antonio, including a 20% drop in ozone since 2003.

Most importantly, natural gas has kept power prices affordable for hundreds of thousands of local families. As of February 2019, the average residential energy price for CPS Energy customers was 10.8 cents per kilowatt-hour, which is lower than both the state and national averages. CPS Energy's reliance on natural gas for a large share of its fuel mix (46%) is a key reason for these low prices. Dramatically changing CPS Energy's fuel mix only raises the risk of future rate hikes.

High utility bills hit low-income families the hardest, creating even more economic hardship for those who can least afford it. In any discussion about San Antonio's energy future, the cost of electricity must remain a high priority.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments and feedback on the city's plan.

Sincerely,

Steve Everley
Spokesman
<u>Texans for Natural Gas</u>

#### **Confidentiality Notice:**

This email and any attachments may be confidential and protected by legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient, be aware that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the e-mail or any attachment is prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please notify us immediately by replying to the sender and then delete this copy and the reply from your system. Thank you for your cooperation.

February 18, 2019

CPS Energy Board of Trustees 145 Navarro San Antonio, TX 78205



#### Dear Trustees:

On behalf of the 9,500 members of Texans for Natural Gas who live and work in Bexar County, we are writing to express our concern regarding the city's draft "Climate Ready" plan, which seeks to phase out reliable and affordable fuel sources like natural gas.

Natural gas is a critical part of San Antonio's economy. In 2018, natural gas accounted for 46% of CPS Energy's fuel mix.<sup>1</sup> It heats homes and keeps energy costs low. It's not a coincidence that CPS Energy currently has residential energy rates (10.8 cents per kWh, as of Feb. 2019) that are lower than both the Texas and national averages.<sup>2</sup>

By forcing CPS Energy to adopt a fuel mix based on politics instead of reliability and affordability, we are concerned that the draft "Climate Ready" plan will result in rate hikes for San Antonio citizens, and higher power bills will disproportionately harm low-income families in San Antonio. High utility bills are the primary reason why people resort to payday loans, and they play an outsized role in keeping families in poverty, according to the Center for Financial Services Innovation.<sup>3</sup>

We support San Antonio's commitment to lower emissions and a cleaner environment. That's why we believe natural gas should continue to play a major role in the local energy mix.

When used for electricity generation, natural gas is among the cleanest energy sources. It also has a proven track record of helping San Antonio improve its air quality. The city's increased use of natural gas has delivered the rare combination of lower emissions and more affordable power bills: Since 2003, ozone levels in San Antonio have declined by 20 percent, thanks in no small part to CPS Energy steadily increasing its use of clean-burning natural gas.<sup>4</sup>

Natural gas is also critical in addressing climate change. Over the past 15 years, no fuel has done more to reduce carbon dioxide (CO2) emissions in the United States than natural gas. Thanks to increased use of clean-burning natural gas, the United States has led the world in reducing greenhouse gas emissions. A report from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency released last fall found that U.S. emissions dropped by almost 3 percent from 2016 to 2017, one that was largely attributed to low-cost natural gas.

According to the U.S. Energy Information Administration, since 2006, increased natural gas use in the U.S. power sector has prevented nearly 2.4 billion metric tons of CO2 from entering the atmosphere. That

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://www.cpsenergy.com/content/dam/corporate/en/Documents/Finance/FY% 202018% 20Budget% 20Plan% 20-% 20FINAL.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> https://www.cpsenergy.com/en/about-us/who-we-are/financial-information/fuel-charges.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> https://www.fdic.gov/news/conferences/consumersymposium/2012/a complex portrait.pdf

<sup>4</sup> https://www.ksat.com/news/most-of-san-antonios-air-pollution-comes-from-other-cities-countries-aacog-says

 $<sup>^{5}\</sup> https://www.bp.com/en/global/corporate/energy-economics/statistical-review-of-world-energy.html$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> https://www.epa.gov/ghgreporting/ghgrp-reported-data

savings is equivalent to taking approximately 500 million passenger vehicles off the road for an entire year. The CO2 savings from natural gas was nearly 60% greater than the amount of CO2 that renewables prevented from being emitted over the same period.<sup>7</sup>

In Pennsylvania, increased use of natural gas helped the commonwealth meet its emissions goals under the federal Clean Power Plan, according to the head of the Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection.<sup>8</sup>

Along with these facts, San Antonio has the opportunity to learn from others who tried to move too quickly toward a "100% renewables" power mix.

The City of Georgetown, just a few hours north on I-35, recently attempted to go "100% renewable" on the assumption that it would deliver lower and more stable energy bills. Instead, residents will now be paying \$150 more per year according to the city's own estimate. The threshold beyond which experts believe energy ceases to be "affordable" is 6 percent of a household's income. For low income residents, \$150 represents much more than 6%, and can be the difference between being able to afford groceries, medicine and other necessities.

Ironically, the reason Georgetown's plan failed was because electricity prices declined more rapidly than they had planned – a price decline due in part to affordable natural gas. If the goal is to keep power prices low, phasing out natural gas is the wrong path.

The City of Vancouver pursued its own anti-natural gas plan with similarly worrisome results. A study by Resource Works suggested that the City of Vancouver's policies could actually lead to increased greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions.<sup>11</sup>

In Germany, government officials have pushed for a rapid transition away from fossil fuels. As a result, Germany now has among the highest electricity prices in Europe, 12 and the transition to "cleaner energy" has created so many reliability problems that the country remains, according to the *New York Times*, "addicted to coal." 13

Texans for Natural Gas is urging the city of San Antonio to carefully consider the broad implications of its draft climate plan, particularly its potential impact on local residents' power bills. We hope the San Antonio City Council will take these facts into account before proceeding down a potentially dangerous path of higher power bills and less economic competitiveness.

Sincerely,

Texans for Natural Gas www.TexansforNaturalGas.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> https://www.eia.gov/environment/emissions/carbon/

<sup>8</sup> https://twitter.com/MarcellusGas/status/1096109411494436864

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> https://georgetown.org/2019/01/22/city-adjusts-customer-energy-charge/

<sup>10</sup> http://www.homeenergyaffordabilitygap.com/

<sup>11</sup> https://www.resourceworks.com/defacto-ban

<sup>12</sup> https://www.reuters.com/article/us-germany-energy-retail/german-consumers-paying-record-prices-for-power-portal-idUSKCN1P9233

<sup>13</sup> https://www.nytimes.com/2018/10/10/world/europe/germany-coal-climate.html